

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN**

ROSE COULTER-OWENS,  
individually, and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

TIME INC., a Delaware Corporation,

Defendant.

Case No. 2:12-cv-14390-GCS-MKM

Hon. George C. Steeh

**FIRST AMENDED CLASS  
ACTION COMPLAINT AND  
DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL**

**FIRST AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT  
AND DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL**

Plaintiff Rose Coulter-Owens brings this class action complaint against Defendant Time Inc. (“Time”) to obtain redress for all persons injured by Time’s intentional and unlawful disclosure of Plaintiff’s and its other subscribers’ highly personal and sensitive information. For her First Amended Class Action Complaint (“Complaint”), Plaintiff alleges as follows upon personal knowledge as to herself and her own acts and experiences, and, as to all other matters, upon information and belief, including investigation conducted by her attorneys:

**NATURE OF THE CASE**

1. Time is “one of the largest branded media companies in the world,”<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Time Inc. About Us, <http://www.timeinc.com/aboutus/> (last visited Nov. 9, 2013).

publishing over 115 magazines, including *TIME*, *Sports Illustrated*, *People*, *Fortune*, *GOLF Magazine*, *All You*, *Southern Living*, *Real Simple*, *This Old House*, and *Health*.

2. To supplement its sales and advertising revenues, Time also sells its subscribers' personal information—including their full names, titles of magazines subscribed to, and home addresses (collectively "Personal Reading Information"), as well as myriad other personal, lifestyle, and demographic information such as e-mail addresses, gender, age, net worth, home value, political party, religion, and medical conditions, and, when applicable, the number and gender of children living in the household—to data miners and other third parties.

3. Time's disclosure of such personal, demographic, and lifestyle information is problematic because it allows for highly specific targeting of groups of individuals. For example, anyone could buy from Time a list with the names and addresses of all *TIME* subscribers who are single, recently moved to Ferndale, have a net worth over \$1,000,000, require corrective lenses, and donate to international aid causes. Time would sell such a list for approximately \$177 per thousand subscribers listed.

4. While Time profits handsomely from such practices, its subscribers are completely unaware that their personal information is sold on the open market.

In fact, Time never receives its customers' consent prior to selling their Personal Reading Information.

5. By selling its customers' Personal Reading Information without their consent, Time not only disregards its customers' safety and basic privacy rights, but also violates Michigan's Video Rental Privacy Act, M.C.L. § 445.1712 ("VRPA"), which prohibits companies from disclosing without permission any record or information concerning a customer's purchase of written materials if the record identifies the customer.

6. Accordingly, Plaintiff brings this Class Action Complaint against Time for its intentional and unlawful disclosure of its customers' Personal Reading Information in violation of the VRPA, for breach of contract, and in the alternative to breach of contract, for unjust enrichment.

### **PARTIES**

7. Plaintiff Rose Coulter-Owens is a natural person and citizen of the State of Michigan.

8. Defendant Time Inc. is a Delaware corporation with its principal place of business at 1271 Avenue of the Americas, in the City of New York, State of New York. Time does business throughout Michigan and the United States.

### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

9. This Court has personal jurisdiction over Time because it is registered

to do, and regularly does, business in Michigan, including soliciting consumer business from, and entering into consumer transactions with, Michigan consumers. Further, the unlawful conduct alleged in the Complaint occurred in, was directed at, and/or emanated from, Michigan.

10. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332(d) because at least one Class member is a citizen of a different state than Defendant, the amount in controversy exceeds \$5,000,000.00, exclusive of interest and costs, and none of the exceptions under that subsection apply to this action.

11. Venue is proper in this Court under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(a) because a substantial part of the events and omissions giving rise to the claim occurred in this District. 28 U.S.C. § 1391(a)(2). Venue is additionally proper because Plaintiff resides within this District in Oakland County, and Defendant transacts significant business in this District, including soliciting consumer business and entering into consumer transactions.

## **FACTUAL BACKGROUND**

### ***Michigan's Video Rental Privacy Act***

12. In 1988, members of the United States Senate warned that records of consumers' purchases and rentals of audiovisual and written materials offer "a window into our loves, likes, and dislikes," and that "the trail of information

generated by every transaction that is now recorded and stored in sophisticated record-keeping systems is a new, more subtle and pervasive form of surveillance.”

S. Rep. No. 100-599, at 7–8 (1988) (statements of Sens. Simon and Leahy, respectively).

13. Recognizing the need to protect its citizens’ privacy rights, Michigan’s legislature enacted the VRPA “to preserve personal privacy with respect to the purchase, rental, or borrowing of certain materials,” by prohibiting companies from disclosing certain types of sensitive consumer information. H.B. No. 5331, 1988 Mich. Legis. Serv. 378.

14. Section 2 of the VRPA states:

[A] person, or an employee or agent of the person, engaged in the business of selling at retail, renting, or lending books or other written materials . . . *shall not disclose* to any person, other than the customer, a record or information concerning the purchase . . . of those materials by a customer that indicates the identity of the customer.

M.C.L. § 445.1712 (emphasis added).

15. Michigan’s protection of reading information reflects the “gut feeling that people ought to be able to read books and watch films without the whole world knowing,” and recognizes that “[b]ooks and films are the intellectual vitamins that fuel the growth of individual thought. The whole process of intellectual growth is one of privacy—of quiet, and reflection. This intimate process should be protected

from the disruptive intrusion of a roving eye.” S. Rep. No. 100–599, at 6 (statement of Rep. McCandless).

16. As Senator Patrick Leahy recognized in proposing the Video and Library Privacy Protection Act (later codified as the Video Privacy Protection Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2710), “[i]n practical terms our right to privacy protects the choice of movies that we watch with our family in our own homes. And it protects the selection of books that we choose to read.” 134 Cong. Rec. S5399 (May 10, 1988).

17. Senator Leahy also explained why choices in movies and reading materials are so private: “These activities are at the core of any definition of personhood. They reveal our likes and dislikes, our interests and our whims. They say a great deal about our dreams and ambitions, our fears and our hopes. They reflect our individuality, and they describe us as people.” *Id.*

18. Michigan’s passage of the VRPA also established as a matter of law “that a person’s choice in reading, music, and video entertainment is a private matter, and not a fit subject for consideration by gossipy publications, employers, clubs, or anyone else for that matter.” *Privacy: Sales, Rentals of Videos, etc.*, House Legislative Analysis Section, H.B. No. 5331, Jan. 20, 1989 (attached hereto as Exhibit A.)

19. Despite the fact that thousands of Michigan residents subscribe to Time publications, Time disregards its legal responsibility by systematically violating the VRPA.

***The Personal Information Market:  
Consumers' Personal Information Has Real Value***

20. In 2001, Federal Trade Commission (“FTC”) Commissioner Orson Swindle remarked that “the digital revolution . . . has given an enormous capacity to the acts of collecting and transmitting and flowing of information, unlike anything we’ve ever seen in our life . . . [and] individuals are concerned about being defined by the existing data on themselves.”<sup>2</sup>

21. More than a decade later, Commissioner Swindle’s comments ring truer than ever, as consumer data feeds an information marketplace that supports a \$26 billion dollar per year online advertising industry in the United States.<sup>3</sup>

22. The FTC has also recognized that consumer data possesses inherent monetary value within the new information marketplace, and publicly stated that:

---

<sup>2</sup> The Information Marketplace: Merging and Exchanging Consumer Data, FTC (Mar. 13, 2001), <http://www.ftc.gov/bcp/workshops/infomktplace/transcript.htm> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

<sup>3</sup> See Julia Angwin & Emily Steel, *Web’s Hot New Commodity: Privacy*, WSJ.com (Feb. 28, 2011, 12:01 AM), <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748703529004576160764037920274.html> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

Most consumers cannot begin to comprehend the types and amount of information collected by businesses, or why their information may be commercially valuable. *Data is currency. The larger the data set, the greater potential for analysis—and profit.*<sup>4</sup>

23. It is now a nearly ubiquitous practice for companies that collect consumer information—such as names, addresses, and product purchase histories—to profit from sharing this data with numerous third parties, without ever disclosing such practices to or obtaining consent from the source consumer.

24. In fact, an entire industry exists where companies known as data miners purchase, trade, and otherwise collect massive databases of information about consumers. According to an article on the *TIME* website, data miners then profit by selling this “extraordinarily intrusive” information in an open and largely unregulated market.<sup>5</sup>

25. The scope of data miners’ knowledge about consumers is truly astounding: “If you are an American adult, the odds are that [they] know[] things like your age, race, sex, weight, height, marital status, education level, politics,

---

<sup>4</sup> Statement of FTC Commissioner Pamela Jones Harbour, FTC (Dec. 7, 2009), <http://www.ftc.gov/speeches/harbour/091207privacyroundtable.pdf> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013) (emphasis added).

<sup>5</sup> See Martha C. White, *Big Data Knows What You’re Doing Right Now*, *TIME.com* (July 31, 2012), <http://moneyland.time.com/2012/07/31/big-data-knows-what-youre-doing-right-now/> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).



buying habits, household health worries, vacation dreams—and on and on.”<sup>6</sup>

26. Further, “[a]s use of the Internet has grown, the data broker industry has already evolved to take advantage of the increasingly specific pieces of information about consumers that are now available.”<sup>7</sup>

27. Recognizing the serious threat the data mining industry poses to consumers’ privacy, on July 25, 2012, the co-Chairmen of the Congressional Bi-Partisan Privacy Caucus sent a letter to nine major data brokerage companies seeking information on how those companies collect, store, and sell their massive collections of consumer data.<sup>8</sup>

28. In their letter, the co-Chairmen recognized that:

[t]he business of data brokerage, namely the collecting, assembling, maintaining, and selling to third-parties of consumers’ personal information, has grown into a

---

<sup>6</sup> Natasha Singer, *You for Sale: Mapping, and Sharing, the Consumer Genome*, N.Y. Times, June 16, 2012, at BU1, *available at* <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/06/17/technology/acxiom-the-quiet-giant-of-consumer-database-marketing.html> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

<sup>7</sup> Letter from Senator John D. Rockefeller IV, Chairman, Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation, to Scott E. Howe, Chief Executive Officer, Acxiom, Oct. 9, 2012, *available at* [http://commerce.senate.gov/public/?a=Files.Serve&File\\_id=3bb94703-5ac8-4157-a97b-a658c3c3061c](http://commerce.senate.gov/public/?a=Files.Serve&File_id=3bb94703-5ac8-4157-a97b-a658c3c3061c).

<sup>8</sup> *See Bipartisan Group of Lawmakers Query Data Brokers About Practices Involving Consumers’ Personal Information*, Smart Energy Universe, <http://smartenergyuniverse.com/industry-roundup/3926-bipartisan-group-of-lawmakers-query-data-brokers-about-practices-involving-consumers-personal-information> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

multiple billion dollar industry. *By combining data from numerous offline and online sources, data brokers have developed hidden dossiers on every U.S. consumer.* This large[-]scale aggregation of the personal information of hundreds of millions of American citizens raises a number of serious privacy concerns.<sup>9</sup>

29. Data mining is especially troublesome when consumer information is sold to direct marketing companies. In addition to causing waste and inconvenience, direct marketers often use consumer information to lure unsuspecting consumers into various scams,<sup>10</sup> including fraudulent sweepstakes, charities, and buying clubs. Thus, when companies like Time share information with data miners and direct marketers, they contribute to the “[v]ast databases of names and personal information” that are often “sold to thieves by large publicly traded companies,” which “put[s] almost anyone within the reach of fraudulent telemarketers” and other criminals.<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>9</sup> Letter from Edward J. Markey and Joe Barton, co-Chairmen, Congressional Bi-Partisan Privacy Caucus, to Scott E. Howe, Chief Executive Officer, Acxiom, Oct. 2, 2012, *available at* <http://www.globalregulatoryenforcementlawblog.com/uploads/file/Axciom%20letter1.pdf> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013) (emphasis added).

<sup>10</sup> *Prize Offers: You Don't Have to Pay to Play!*, FTC, <http://www.ftc.gov/bcp/edu/pubs/consumer/telemarketing/tel17.shtm> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

<sup>11</sup> Charles Duhigg, *Bilking the Elderly, With a Corporate Assist*, N.Y. Times, May 20, 2007, at A1, *available at* <http://www.nytimes.com/2007/05/20/business/20tele.html?pagewanted=all> (last visited Nov. 13, 2013).

30. Information disclosures like Time's are particularly dangerous to the elderly. "Older Americans are perfect telemarketing customers, analysts say, because they are often at home, rely on delivery services, and are lonely for the companionship that telephone callers provide."<sup>12</sup> The FTC notes that "[t]he elderly often are the deliberate targets of fraudulent telemarketers who take advantage of the fact that many older people have cash reserves or other assets to spend on seemingly attractive offers."<sup>13</sup>

31. Indeed, an entire black market exists where the personal information of vulnerable elderly Americans is exchanged. Thus, information disclosures like Time's are particularly troublesome because of their cascading nature: "Once marked as receptive to [a specific] type of spam, a consumer is often bombarded with similar fraudulent offers from a host of scam artists."<sup>14</sup>

32. Time is not alone in jeopardizing its subscribers' privacy and well-being in exchange for increased revenue: disclosing subscriber information to data miners, direct marketers, and other third parties is a widespread practice in the publishing industry.

---

<sup>12</sup> *Id.*

<sup>13</sup> *Fraud Against Seniors: Hearing before the Senate Special Committee on Aging*, FTC (Aug. 10, 2000) (prepared statement of the FTC), available at <http://www.ftc.gov/os/2000/08/agingtestimony.htm> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

<sup>14</sup> *Id.*

33. Thus, as consumer data has become an ever-more valuable commodity, the data mining industry has experienced rapid and massive growth. Unfortunately for consumers, this growth has come at the expense of their most basic privacy rights.

***Consumers Place Monetary Value on their Privacy  
and Consider Privacy Practices when Making Purchases***

34. As the data mining industry has grown, so too have consumer concerns regarding the privacy of their personal information.

35. A recent survey conducted by Harris Interactive on behalf of TRUSTe, Inc. showed that 89 percent of consumers polled avoid doing business with companies who they believe do not protect their privacy online.<sup>15</sup> As a result, 81 percent of smartphone users polled said that they avoid using smartphone apps that they don't believe protect their privacy online.<sup>16</sup>

36. Thus, as consumer data has become an ever-more valuable commodity, the data mining industry has experienced rapid and massive growth. Unfortunately for consumers, this growth has come at the expense of their most basic privacy rights.

---

<sup>15</sup> See 2013 TRUSTe US Consumer Confidence Index, TRUSTe, <http://www.truste.com/us-consumer-confidence-index-2013/> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

<sup>16</sup> *Id.*

37. In fact, consumers' personal information has become such a valuable commodity that companies are beginning to offer individuals the opportunity to sell their personal information themselves.<sup>17</sup>

38. These companies' business models capitalize on a fundamental tenet underlying the personal information marketplace: consumers recognize the economic value of their private data. Research shows that consumers are willing to pay a premium to purchase services from companies that adhere to more stringent policies of protecting their personal data.<sup>18</sup>

39. Thus, in today's economy, individuals and businesses alike place a real, quantifiable value on consumer data and corresponding privacy rights.<sup>19</sup> As such, where a business offers customers a service that includes statutorily

---

<sup>17</sup> See Joshua Brustein, *Start-Ups Seek to Help Users Put a Price on Their Personal Data*, N.Y. Times (Feb. 12, 2012), available at <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/02/13/technology/start-ups-aim-to-help-users-put-a-price-on-their-personal-data.html> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

<sup>18</sup> Tsai, Cranor, Acquisti, and Egelman, *The Effect of Online Privacy Information on Purchasing Behavior*, 22(2) Information Systems Research 254, 254 (2011); see also generally European Network and Information Security Agency, *Study on Monetising Privacy* (Feb. 27, 2012), available at <https://www.enisa.europa.eu/activities/identity-and-trust/library/deliverables/monetising-privacy> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).

<sup>19</sup> Hann et al., *The Value of Online Information Privacy: An Empirical Investigation* (Mar. 2003) at 2, available at <http://www.comp.nus.edu.sg/~ipng/research/privacy.pdf> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013) ("The real policy issue is not whether consumers value online privacy. It is obvious that people value online privacy.").

guaranteed privacy protections, yet fails to honor these guarantees, the customer is denied the full monetary value of that transaction.

***Time Unlawfully Sells its Subscribers' Personal Reading Information***

40. Time maintains a vast digital database comprised of its subscribers' Personal Reading Information. Time discloses its subscribers' Personal Reading Information to data mining companies including Acxiom and others, who then supplement that information with additional sensitive personal information about each Time subscriber, including age, income, net worth, home value, marriage status, health ailments, hobbies, political affiliation, travel habits, financial practices, religion, ethnicity, nationality, and, where applicable, number and gender of children in the household. (*See, e.g.*, Exhibits B, C.)

41. Time then sells its mailing lists—which include subscribers' Personal Reading Information, and can include the sensitive information obtained from data miners—to interested third parties, allowing those companies to identify which individuals purchased which magazines. (*Id.*)

42. As a result of Time's data compiling and sharing practices, companies can purchase mailing lists from Time that identify Time subscribers by their most intimate details: income, political affiliation, religion, and even by health ailments such as diabetes or arthritis. Time's disclosure of such sensitive and personal information puts consumers, especially the more vulnerable members of society, at

risk of serious harm from scammers. For example, Time will sell—to anyone willing to pay for it—a list of elderly, Lutheran *Entertainment Weekly* subscribers who are diabetic military veterans, with a net worth above \$500,000, and a susceptibility to mail-order offers.

43. Time does not seek its subscribers' consent prior to any of these disclosures, and its subscribers remain unaware that their Personal Reading Information and other sensitive personal information is being bought and sold on the open market.

44. Consumers can sign up for Time subscriptions through numerous media outlets, including the Internet, telephone, or traditional mail. Regardless of how the consumer subscribes, Time never requires the individual to read or agree to any terms of service, privacy policy, or information-sharing policy. Consequently, Time uniformly fails to obtain any form of consent from—or even provide effective notice to—its subscribers before disclosing their Personal Reading Information.

45. As a result, Time disclosed and continues to disclose its customers' Personal Reading Information—including their reading habits and preferences that can “reveal intimate facts about our lives, from our political and religious beliefs to

our health concerns”<sup>20</sup>—to anybody willing to pay for it.

46. By and through these actions, Time has intentionally disclosed to third parties its Michigan subscribers’ Personal Reading Information without consent, in direct violation of the VRPA and in breach of its contracts with Plaintiff and the other members of the Class.

#### **FACTS RELATING TO ROSE COULTER-OWENS**

47. Plaintiff Rose Coulter-Owens is a citizen of the state of Michigan.

48. Coulter-Owens is a current subscriber to *TIME*.

49. *TIME* is a magazine published, owned, and operated by Time.

50. Coulter-Owens has never agreed to allow Time to sell or disclose her Personal Reading Information to anyone.

51. Time has never given Coulter-Owens prior notice of any sale or disclosure of her Personal Reading Information.

52. However, beginning on the date that Coulter-Owens subscribed to *TIME*, and continuing to the present, Time has disclosed, and continues to disclose, without consent or prior notice, Coulter-Owens’s Personal Reading Information (i.e., information that identifies Coulter-Owens as a *TIME* subscriber) to data

---

<sup>20</sup> *California’s Reader Privacy Act Signed into Law*, Electronic Frontier Foundation (Oct. 3, 2011), <https://www.eff.org/press/archives/2011/10/03> (last visited Nov. 10, 2013).



mining companies including Acxiom and others, who then supplement that information with data from their own files.

53. Furthermore, during that same time period, Time has sold—and continues to sell and offer for sale—mailing lists containing Coulter-Owens’s Personal Reading Information to third parties seeking to contact Time subscribers, without first obtaining Coulter-Owens’s consent or even giving her prior notice of the sales.

54. Because Time disclosed and sold her Personal Reading Information, Coulter-Owens now receives a deluge of junk mail and telephone solicitations offering, among other things, discounted magazine subscriptions. These unwanted offers waste Coulter-Owens’s time, money, and resources, and cause her emotional distress, including irritation, annoyance, and anxiety and fear that her personal information will fall into the hands of thieves and scammers. Time’s sale of Coulter-Owens’s Personal Reading Information directly contributed to the increase in harassing junk mail and phone calls Coulter-Owens received.

55. Additionally, because Coulter-Owens is entitled by law to privacy in her Personal Reading Information, and because she paid money for her *TIME* subscription, Time’s sale of Coulter-Owens’s Personal Reading Information deprived her of the full set of benefits to which she was entitled as part of her *TIME* subscription, thereby causing her economic harm.

## CLASS ACTION ALLEGATIONS

56. **Class Definition:** Plaintiff brings this action on behalf of herself and a proposed Class, defined as follows:

All Michigan residents who had their Personal Reading Information disclosed to third parties by Time without consent.

Excluded from the Class are (1) Defendant, Defendant's agents, subsidiaries, parents, successors, predecessors, and any entity in which the Defendant or their parents have a controlling interest and their current and former employees, officers, and directors, (2) the Judge or Magistrate Judge to whom this case is assigned and the Judge's or Magistrate Judge's immediate family, (3) persons who execute and file a timely request for exclusion, (4) all persons who have previously had claims similar to those alleged herein finally adjudicated or who have released their claims against Defendant, and (5) the legal representatives, successors, or assigns of any such excluded person.

57. **Numerosity:** The exact number of Class members is unknown to Plaintiff at this time, but it is clear that individual joinder of each Class member is impracticable. Defendant has deceived, and profited from selling the Personal Reading Information of thousands of consumers who fall into the definition set forth above. Ultimately, members of the Class will be easily identified through Defendant's records.

58. **Typicality:** Plaintiff's claims are typical of the claims of the other

Class members. Plaintiff and the Class sustained damages as a result of Defendant's uniform wrongful conduct, based upon Defendant's disclosure of Plaintiff's and the Class's Personal Reading Information.

59. **Adequate Representation:** Plaintiff will fairly and adequately represent and protect the interests of the Class, and has retained counsel competent and experienced in complex litigation and class actions. Plaintiff has no interests antagonistic to those of the Class, and Defendant has no defenses unique to Plaintiff. Plaintiff and her counsel are committed to vigorously prosecuting this action on behalf of the Class members, and they have the financial resources to do so. Neither Plaintiff nor her counsel have any interest adverse to those of the other Class members.

60. **Commonality and Predominance:** Common questions of law and fact exist as to all members of the Class, and predominate over any questions affecting only individual members. Those questions with respect to the Class include, but are not limited to:

- (a) Whether Time is "engaged in the business of selling at retail" books or other written materials (i.e., magazines);
- (b) Whether Time obtained consent before disclosing to third parties Plaintiff's and the Class's Personal Reading Information;

- (c) Whether Time's disclosure of Plaintiff's and the Class's Personal Reading Information violated the Video Rental Privacy Act, M.C.L. § 445.1712;
- (d) Whether Time's sale of Plaintiff's and the Class's Personal Reading Information constitutes a breach of contract; and
- (e) Whether Time's sale and disclosure of Plaintiff's and the Class's Personal Reading Information constitutes unjust enrichment.

61. **Superiority:** Class proceedings are superior to all other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy, as joinder of all Class members is impracticable. The damages suffered by the individual Class members will likely be small relative to the burden and expense of individual prosecution of the complex litigation necessitated by Defendant's actions. Thus, it would be virtually impossible for the Class members to obtain effective relief from Defendant's misconduct on an individual basis. Even if Class members could sustain individual litigation, it would not be preferable to a class action, because individual litigation would increase the delay and expense to all parties due to the complex legal and factual controversies presented in this Complaint. By contrast, a class action presents far fewer management difficulties and provides the benefits of single adjudication, economy of scale, and comprehensive supervision by a single

court. Economies of time, effort, and expense will be fostered and uniformity of decisions will be ensured.

62. **Policies Generally Applicable to the Class:** This class action is also appropriate for certification because Defendant has acted or refused to act on grounds generally applicable to the Class as a whole, thereby requiring the Court's imposition of uniform relief to ensure compatible standards of conduct toward the Class members and making final injunctive relief appropriate with respect to the Class as a whole. Defendant's practices challenged herein apply to and affect the Class members uniformly, and Plaintiff's challenge of those practices hinges on Defendant's conduct with respect to the Class as a whole, not on facts or law applicable only to Plaintiff.

63. Plaintiff reserves the right to revise the definition of the Class as necessary based upon information learned in discovery.

**FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION**  
**Violation of the Video Rental Privacy Act**  
**(M.C.L. § 445.1712)**  
**(On Behalf of Plaintiff and the Class)**

64. Plaintiff incorporates the foregoing allegations as if fully set forth herein.

65. As a magazine publisher that sells subscriptions to consumers, Time is engaged in the business of selling written materials at retail. M.C.L. § 445.1712.

66. By subscribing to *TIME*, Coulter-Owens purchased written materials

from Time. M.C.L. § 445.1712.

67. Because Coulter-Owens purchased written materials directly from Time, she is a “customer” within the meaning of the VRPA. M.C.L. § 445.1711(a).

68. At all times relevant, and beginning when Coulter-Owens first subscribed to *TIME*, Time disclosed—and continues to disclose—Coulter-Owens’s Personal Reading Information, which identifies her as a *TIME* subscriber, in at least two ways.

69. First, Time disclosed mailing lists containing Coulter-Owens’s Personal Reading Information to data mining companies including Acxiom and others, who then supplemented the mailing lists with additional sensitive information from their own databases, before sending the mailing lists back to Time.

70. Second, Time sold its mailing lists containing Coulter-Owens’s Personal Reading Information—enhanced with additional information from data miners—to interested third parties, who could then use the mailing lists to contact Time subscribers. These third parties included other consumer-facing businesses, educational institutions, and organizations soliciting monetary and other contributions.

71. Because the mailing lists included the additional information from the data miners, the lists were more valuable, and Time was able to increase its profits

gained from the mailing list sales.

72. By selling and otherwise disclosing its subscriber lists, Time disclosed to persons other than Plaintiff records or information concerning her purchase of written materials from Time. M.C.L. § 445.1712.

73. The information disclosed by Time indicates Coulter-Owens's name and address, as well as the fact that she subscribes to *TIME*. Accordingly, the records or information disclosed by Time indicate Coulter-Owens's identity. M.C.L. § 445.1712.

74. Coulter-Owens never consented to Time disclosing her Personal Reading Information to anyone.

75. Worse still, Time did not even give Coulter-Owens prior notice of its disclosure of her Personal Reading Information to third parties.

76. On information and belief, Time's disclosures of Coulter-Owens's Personal Reading Information were not made pursuant to a court order, search warrant, or grand jury subpoena.

77. On information and belief, Time's disclosures of Coulter-Owens's Personal Reading Information were not made to collect payment for their subscriptions.

78. Time's disclosures of Coulter-Owens's Personal Reading information were made to data miners, direct mail advertisers, and organizations soliciting

monetary and other contributions, all in order to increase Time's revenue.

Accordingly, Time's disclosures were not made for the exclusive purpose of marketing goods and services directly to Coulter-Owens.

79. By disclosing Coulter-Owens's Personal Reading Information, Time violated Coulter-Owens's common law right to privacy.

80. By disclosing Coulter-Owens's Personal Reading Information, Time violated Coulter-Owens's statutorily protected right to privacy in her reading habits. M.C.L. § 445.1712.

81. Additionally, because Coulter-Owens paid for her Time subscription, and Time was obligated to comply with the VRPA, Time's unlawful disclosure of Coulter-Owens's Personal Reading Information deprived her of the full value of her paid-for subscriptions. Because Coulter-Owens ascribes monetary value to the privacy of her Personal Reading Information, Time's unlawful sale and disclosure of her Personal Reading Information caused her to receive less value than she paid for, thereby causing her economic harm.

82. Likewise, because Coulter-Owens and the other Class members ascribe monetary value to the privacy of their Personal Reading Information, a magazine subscription that keeps their Personal Reading Information private is more valuable than one that does not.

83. Accordingly, had Coulter-Owens been adequately informed of Time's



disclosure practices, she would not have been willing to purchase her *TIME* subscription at the price charged, if at all. Thus, Time's unlawful disclosures caused Coulter-Owens economic harm.

84. Time's disclosure of Coulter-Owens's Personal Reading Information to third parties has also caused an influx of third-party print advertisements and marketing calls to her cellular phone, causing emotional distress in the form of irritation, aggravation, anxiety, and fear that her information will be obtained and misused by thieves and scammers, as well as damages in the form of decreased available cellular phone minutes.

85. As a result of Time's unlawful and continued disclosure of their Personal Reading Information, Plaintiff and the other Class members have suffered privacy and economic injuries. On behalf of herself and the Class, Plaintiff seeks: (1) an injunction requiring Defendant Time to obtain consent from Michigan subscribers prior to the disclosure of their Personal Reading Information as required by the VRPA; (2) actual damages, including disgorgement, or \$5,000.00, whichever is greater, per Class member pursuant to M.C.L. § 445.1715(a); and (3) costs and reasonable attorneys' fees pursuant to M.C.L. § 445.1715(b).

**SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION**  
**Breach of Contract**  
**(On Behalf of Plaintiff and the Class)**<sup>21</sup>

86. Plaintiff incorporates the foregoing allegations as if fully set forth herein.

87. Time offered to sell magazine subscriptions to Coulter-Owens and the other Class members for specific prices.

88. Coulter-Owens and the other Class members accepted Time's offers by agreeing to pay the offered prices as consideration for purchasing the magazine subscriptions.

89. Accordingly, Time, on the one hand, and Coulter-Owens and the other Class members, on the other, entered into binding contracts for magazine subscriptions.

90. Because the laws existing at the time and place of the making of a contract are incorporated into it, the contracts between Time and Coulter-Owens and the other Class members included obligations for the parties to abide by all applicable laws, including the VRPA.

91. Coulter-Owens and the other Class members performed their

---

<sup>21</sup> Coulter-Owens recognizes that the Court dismissed the previous plaintiff's claim for breach of contract and that her allegations likely fall within the scope of the Court's prior dismissal. Accordingly, Plaintiff asserts the contract claim primarily to preserve it for appeal.

obligations under the contracts by paying the consideration owed to Time for the purchase of the magazine subscriptions, and by complying with all applicable laws.

92. The ability to control disclosure of sensitive personal information—such as Personal Reading Information—is material to any consumer transaction because it is likely to affect a consumer’s decision to, or conduct regarding, purchase of a product or service.

93. Time’s failure to perform its contractual obligations imposed by the VRPA—i.e., maintaining confidentiality of subscribers’ Personal Reading Information—constitutes a material breach by Time of its contracts with Coulter-Owens and the other Class members.

94. Plaintiff and the other Class members have suffered actual damages as a result of Time’s breach in the form of the value Coulter-Owens and the other Class members paid for and ascribed to the confidentiality of their Personal Reading Information. This amount is tangible and will be calculated at trial.

95. Further, a portion of the purchase price of each Time subscription sold to Coulter-Owens and the other Class members was intended to ensure the confidentiality of Coulter-Owens’s and the other Class members’ Personal Reading Information, as required by the VRPA. Because Coulter-Owens and the other Class members were denied services that they paid for and were entitled to receive—i.e.,

confidentiality of their Personal Reading Information—they incurred actual monetary damages.

96. Additionally, because Time profited from its breach, Coulter-Owens and the other Class members are entitled to disgorgement of all profits obtained by Time from its unlawful disclosure of its subscribers' Personal Reading Information.

97. Accordingly, Plaintiff and the other Class members seek an order declaring that Time's conduct constitutes breach of contract, and awarding Plaintiff and the Class disgorgement of Time's unlawfully obtained profits, and damages in an amount to be calculated at trial.

**THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION**  
**Unjust Enrichment**  
**(On Behalf of Plaintiff and the Class)**  
**(In the Alternative to Breach of Contract)**

98. Plaintiff incorporates the allegations contained in paragraphs 1 through 85 as if fully set forth herein.

99. Coulter-Owens's claim for unjust enrichment is brought in the alternative to her claim for breach of contract.

100. Coulter-Owens and the Class members conferred a benefit on Time by providing Time with their Personal Reading Information and paying Time for their magazine subscriptions. Time received and retained the information and money

belonging to Coulter-Owens and the Class when Plaintiff and the Class subscribed to Time publications.

101. Because Time received and processed Coulter-Owens's and the Class's subscription payments and Personal Reading Information, and because Time has employees handling customer accounts and billing as well as customer data, Time appreciates or has knowledge of such benefits.

102. Under the VRPA, Coulter-Owens and the Class members were entitled to confidentiality in their Personal Reading Information as part of their subscriptions.

103. Under principles of equity and good conscience, because Time failed to comply with the VRPA, Time should not be allowed to retain the full amount of money Coulter-Owens and the Class paid for their subscriptions or the money it received by selling Coulter-Owens's and the Class's Personal Reading Information.

104. Coulter-Owens and the other Class members have suffered actual damages as a result of Time's unlawful conduct in the form the value Coulter-Owens and the other Class members paid for and ascribed to confidentiality of their Personal Reading Information. This amount is tangible and will be calculated at trial.

105. Further, a portion of the purchase price of each Time subscription sold

to Coulter-Owens and the other Class members was intended to ensure the confidentiality of Coulter-Owens's and the other Class members' Personal Reading Information, as required by the VRPA. Because Plaintiff and the other Class members were denied services that they paid for and were entitled to receive—i.e., confidentiality of their Personal Reading Information—they incurred actual monetary damages.

106. To prevent inequity, Time should return to Coulter-Owens and the Class the value they ascribe to confidentiality of their Personal Reading Information and all money derived from Time's sale and disclosure of Coulter-Owens's and the Class's Personal Reading Information.

107. Accordingly, Plaintiff and the Class members seek an order declaring that Time's conduct constitutes unjust enrichment, and awarding Plaintiff and the Class restitution in an amount to be calculated at trial equal to the amount of money obtained by Time through its sale and disclosure of Plaintiff's and the Class's Personal Reading Information.

### **PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

**WHEREFORE**, Plaintiff Rose Coulter-Owens, on behalf of herself and the Class, prays that the Court enter judgment in her favor and against Time and for the following relief:

- (1) Certify the Class as defined above, appoint Plaintiff as Class Representative, and designate her counsel as Class Counsel;

- (2) Declare that Time's conduct as described herein violates the Video Rental Privacy Act, M.C.L. § 445.1712;
- (3) Declare that Time's conduct as described herein constitutes a breach of contract, or, in the alternative, unjust enrichment;
- (4) Award actual damages, including disgorgement, or \$5,000, whichever is greater, to each Class member, as provided by the Video Rental Privacy Act, M.C.L. § 445.1715(a);
- (5) Award injunctive and equitable relief as is necessary to protect the interests of Plaintiff and the Class by requiring Time to cease the unlawful disclosures discussed herein;
- (6) Award of reasonable attorneys' fees, interest and costs, M.C.L. § 445.1715(b); and
- (7) Such other and further relief as the Court deems equitable and just.

### **DEMAND FOR TRIAL BY JURY**

Plaintiff requests trial by jury of all claims that can be so tried.

Dated: November 15, 2013

Respectfully submitted,

**Rose Coulter-Owens**, individually  
and on behalf of all others similarly  
situated

By: /s/ J. Dominick Larry  
One of her attorneys

Henry M. Scharg  
LAW OFFICE OF HENRY M. SCHARG  
302 W. Main Street  
Northville, Michigan 48167  
Tel: (248) 596-1111

Fax: (248) 596-1578  
hmsattyatlaw@aol.com

Ari J. Scharg  
J. Dominick Larry  
EDELSON LLC  
350 N. LaSalle, Suite 1300  
Chicago, Illinois 60654  
Tel: (312) 589-6370  
Fax: (312) 589-6378  
nlarry@edelson.com  
ascharg@edelson.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Rose Coulter-Owens and the putative Class*



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, J. Dominick Larry, an attorney, certify that on November 15, 2013, I served the above and foregoing *Plaintiff's First Amended Class Action Complaint* by causing true and accurate copies of such paper to be filed and transmitted to all counsel of record via the Court's CM/ECF electronic filing system, on this November 15, 2013.

/s/ J. Dominick Larry \_\_\_\_\_

# **EXHIBIT A**



Washington Square Building, Suite 1025  
Lansing, Michigan 48909  
Phone: 517/373-6466

**PRIVACY: SALES, RENTALS OF VIDEOS, ETC.**

**House Bill 5331** as enrolled  
**Second Analysis (1-20-89)**

**Sponsor: Rep. David Honigman**  
**House Committee: Judiciary**  
**Senate Committee: Judiciary**

***THE APPARENT PROBLEM:***

During the period when Congressional confirmation hearings were being held on the nomination of Robert Bork to the Supreme Court, a Washington weekly obtained and published a list of videotapes rented under Bork's wife's account. Many found this to be an unwarranted invasion of privacy, and the incident prompted the introduction in Congress of a bill to protect the privacy of those who rent or buy videotapes. Many in Michigan also believe that one's choice in videos, records, and books is nobody's business but one's own, and suggest the enactment of a statute to explicitly protect a consumer's privacy in buying and borrowing such items.

***THE CONTENT OF THE BILL:***

The bill would create a new public act to preserve personal privacy with respect to the purchase, rental, or borrowing of written materials, sound recordings, and video recordings. Except as otherwise provided by law, a retailer, lender, or renter of such items could not disclose information — such as selections made — on a particular customer to any person other than that customer. Such information could be disclosed with the customer's written permission, under a court order, to the extent reasonably necessary to collect past-due payment, for the exclusive purpose of marketing goods and services directly to the consumer, or under a search warrant. Violation of the bill would be a misdemeanor.

***FISCAL IMPLICATIONS:***

The House Fiscal Agency says that the bill would have no fiscal implications. (1-18-89)

***ARGUMENTS:***

***For:***

The bill would recognize that a person's choice in reading, music, and video entertainment is a private matter, and not a fit subject for consideration by gossip publications, employers, clubs, or anyone else, for that matter. The bill would complement the Library Privacy Act, which exempts library records on a person from disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act and prohibits disclosure absent a court order or the individual's consent.

***Response:*** The bill, while laudable in its aims, may be unnecessary for libraries, which already are subject to civil penalties for violating the Library Privacy Act.

***Against:***

The bill could offer more in the way of recourse for injured parties if it provided for civil damages as well as criminal misdemeanor penalties. Civil remedies not only offer a person recompense for harm done: they free a person from having to rely on a prosecutor's office to pursue a case.

H.B. 5331 (1-20-89)

# **EXHIBIT B**

# Mailing List Finder

All Mailing Lists

- 1 Start 2 Results 3 Data Card 4 Request 5 Finished



**POSTAL, EMAIL AND TELEPHONE LISTS**

[Click Here](#)  
To Fill Out A Form And Receive A Free Quote

## Time Inc. Magazines Group Enhanced Masterfile Mailing List

Reach millions of consumers from a rich variety of lifestyles and demographics for highly targeted mailings with this merged, unduplicated database of over 19 titles from Time Inc. Subscribers have been enhanced with InfoBase Data to identify hundreds of lifestyle and demographic segments. Included in this Group Enhanced Database are subscribers to All You, Coastal Living, Cooking Light, Entertainment Weekly, ESSENCE, FORTUNE, GOLF Magazine, Health, InStyle, Money, People, People StyleWatch, Real Simple, Southern Living, Sports Illustrated, Sunset, This Old House, and TIME. With the broad range of lifestyle demographic and purchase data available, combined with the substantial universe, even the most targeted campaigns will have success with this masterfile.

[Get Count](#)

[Get Pricing](#)

[Get More Information](#)

SEGMENTS	COUNTS THROUGH 10/03/2013	
13,004,210 TOTAL UNIVERSE / BASE RATE		\$95.00/M
1,415,242 1 MONTH SUBSCRIBERS		+ \$16.00/M
3,678,767 3 MONTH SUBSCRIBERS		+ \$12.00/M
4,866,150 ACTIVE MALE SUBSCRIBERS		+ \$8.00/M
8,333,538 ACTIVE FEMALE SUBSCRIBERS		+ \$8.00/M
251,444 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS AGE 18-25		+ \$16.00/M
1,183,164 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS AGE 26-35		+ \$16.00/M
2,855,345 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS AGE 36-49		+ \$16.00/M
7,625,630 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS AGE 50+		+ \$16.00/M
3,268,976 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS AGE 66+		+ \$16.00/M
4,178,026 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH CHILDREN		+ \$16.00/M
8,345,473 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH INCOME \$75K+		+ \$16.00/M
1,949,452 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH NETWORTH \$1MM+		+ \$20.00/M
10,625,557 ACTIVE HOMEOWNERS		+ \$16.00/M
8,457,327 ACTIVE MARRIED SUBSCRIBERS		+ \$16.00/M
8,977,975 ACTIVE DONORS		+ \$16.00/M
1,145,045 ACTIVE HISPANIC SUBSCRIBERS		+ \$16.00/M
1,393,415 ACTIVE AFRICAN AMERICAN SUBSCRIBERS		+ \$16.00/M
1,437,925 ACTIVE VETERANS		+ \$16.00/M
9,954,434 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH COOKING INTEREST		+ \$16.00/M
2,150,343 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH WINE INTEREST		+ \$16.00/M
8,213,697 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH CRAFTS INTEREST		+ \$16.00/M
5,465,396 ACTIVE PET OWNERS		+ \$16.00/M
4,674,074 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH GREEN LIVING INTEREST		\$16.00/M
4,041,789 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH SWEEPSTAKES INTEREST		+ \$16.00/M
3,373,681 ACTIVE CATHOLICS		+ \$16.00/M
2,190,231 ACTIVE SUBSCRIBERS WITH RELIGIOUS/INSPIRATIONAL INTEREST		+ \$16.00/M
FUNDRAISING/CATALOG RATE \$75/M		

### DESCRIPTION

Reach millions of consumers from a rich variety of lifestyles and demographics for highly targeted mailings with this merged, unduplicated database of over 19 titles from Time Inc. Subscribers have been enhanced with InfoBase Data to identify hundreds of lifestyle and demographic segments.

POPULARITY:	100
MARKET:	CONSUMER
CHANNELS:	<input type="checkbox"/>
SOURCE:	OTHER
PRIVACY:	UNKNOWN
DMA?:	YES - MEMBER
STATUS:	STANDARD PROVIDER
GEO:	USA
<b>SELECTS</b>	
1 MONTH HOTLINE	\$16.00/M
3 MONTH HOTLINE	\$12.00/M
6 MONTH HOTLINE	\$8.00/M
AGE, INCOME	\$16.00/M
BUSINESS ADDRESS	\$14.00/M
CANCELLATION FEE	\$100.00/F
GENDER/SEX	\$8.00/M
KEY CODE	\$2.00/M
LIFESTYLE	\$16.00/M
MINIMUM FULFILLMENT FEE	\$50.00/F
SOURCE	\$10.00/M
STATE, SCF, ZIP	\$8.00/M
ZIP PROCESSING FEE	\$50.00/F
<b>ADDRESSING</b>	
KEY CODING	\$2.00/M
FTP	\$50.00/F
<b>RELATED LISTS</b>	



**CONSUMERBASE MAKES IT EASY TO FIND YOUR TARGET AUDIENCE**

**FILTER YOUR LISTS WITH UNIQUE SELECTS AND FIND YOUR TARGET MARKET**

[GET A FREE QUOTE](#)

Included in this Group Enhanced Database are subscribers to All You, Coastal Living, Cooking Light, Entertainment Weekly, ESSENCE, FORTUNE, GOLF Magazine, Health, InStyle, Money, People, People en Español, People StyleWatch, Real Simple, Southern Living, Sports Illustrated, Sunset, This Old House, and TIME. With the broad range of lifestyle, demographic and purchase data available, combined with the substantial universe, even the most targeted campaigns will have success with this masterfile.

**Source:** Direct Mail

AMERICAN EXPRESS  
PUBLISHING ENHANCED  
DATABASE  
SMITHSONIAN  
MAGAZINE  
BONNIER  
CORPORATION  
ENHANCED MASTERFILE  
MONEY MAGAZINE  
ENHANCED  
HEARST MASTERFILE  
WILLIAMS-SONOMA -  
THE UNIVERSE FILE  
CONSUMER REPORTS  
PARALYZED VETERANS  
OF AMERICA PREMIUM  
DONOR MASTERFILE  
NOZA ENHANCED  
DONOR MASTERFILE  
CONDE NAST -  
ENHANCED DATABASE

**Pricing:**

Policy: Net Name 85%  
Minimum: 50,000 Run Charge: \$10/M

**Terms:** Cancelled orders before the mail date incurs: 100/L cancellation fee, output, applicable run charges and enhancement fees. Orders Cancelled after the mail date, full charges apply.

**Additional Selects (Please inquire for specific counts)**

Demographics		Contributor/Donors	
Age 18-99	14,734,450	Animal Welfare	1,326,245
Presence of Children 0-17	5,498,803	Arts/Cultural	158,880
Child Gender- Female	664,344	Children	1,569,388
Child Gender- Male	724,932	Environmental/Wildlife	1,813,004
# Children in Household	6,686,501	Health	3,767,654
Household Income \$30K+	12,272,583	International Aid	73,479
Networth	15,914,149	Political	158,311
Homeowners	12,575,420	Political- Conservative	95,351
Renter	2,187,281	Political- Liberal	65,343
Home Value	15,889,814	Religious	2,183,443
Length of Residence 1+ Years	14,465,734	Veterans	1,252,378
Married	10,451,083	General Donor	10,063,930
Single	3,657,986	Donates via Mail	548,331
Health Ailments (Interest in)		Travel	
Arthritis	176,067	Airline Travel	1,065,985
Cholesterol	837,153	Business Travel- Domestic	1,316,279
Corrective Lenses	4,771,467	Cruise	2,831,917
Diabetic	523,914	Family Vacation	1,165,491
Disabled	49,080	Frequent Flyer	395,827
Orthopedic	603,756	International Travel	1,383,942
		Leisure Travel	1,437,504
		RV	305,377
		Time Share	370,001
		Travel in US	7,717,032
		Travel Purchase	1,884,236
Hobbies/Interests		Personal Finance	
American History Interest	507,204		
Arts	4,834,014		
Auto Work/Mechanics	5,291,585		
Avid Music Listener	6,554,055		
Beauty/Fashion	9,009,435		

Birdwatching	70,491	Money Seekers	1,383,509
Book Enthusiast	7,488,185	Personal Finance - Active Investors	1,433,814
Casino Gambling	1,948,086	Personal Finance - Foreign Investments	327,781
Children/Family Interest	5,764,529	Personal Finance - Real Estate	983,807
Collectibles	8,016,275	Personal Investments	7,055,998
Collectibles- Antiques	8,009,921	Real Estate Investments	1,904,571
Collectibles- Arts	867,154	Stocks/Bonds	4,453,218
Collectibles- Coins	1,847,449		
Collectibles- Stamps	1,024,492	<b>Sports/Outdoors</b>	
Cooking	11,232,086	ATV Interest	49,150
Cooking- Gourmet	9,299,656	Auto Racing Interest	1,270,919
Cooking- Low Fat	2,958,017	Baseball Interest	2,387,602
Crafts	9,097,650	Basketball Interest	2,206,381
Crafts - Knit/Crochet	98,699	Boat Owner	620,926
Crafts - Needlepoint	31,953	Boating/Sailing Interest	2,201,663
Crafts - Painting	209,679	Camping/Hiking Interest	3,107,332
Crafts - Quilting	65,450	Equestrian Interest	432,065
Crafts - Scrapbooking	145,968	Fishing Interest	3,207,212
Crafts - Sewing	216,831	Football Interest	3,066,422
Crafts - Woodworking	156,157	Golf Interest	3,860,456
Current Affairs	4,245,636	Hockey Interest	876,789
Gardening	10,630,651	Hunting/Shooting Interest	3,583,274
Gift Givers	575,985	Motorcycles	825,152
Grandchildren	2,795,630	Mountain Biking Interest	1,676,551
History/Military Interest	997,407	NASCAR Interest	1,604,409
Home Furnishing	11,869,207	Power Boating Interest	553,311
Home Improvement Interest	7,733,463	Scuba Diving	118,106
Mail Order Buyer	13,145,752	Skiing	991,793
Pet Owner	4,085,150	Soccer	145,893
Pets - Cat Owner	2,581,398	Tennis	689,794
Pets - Dog Owner	3,658,361	Water Sports	84,194
Photography Enthusiast	146,996		
Photography Interest	2,557,753	<b>Religion</b>	
Reading - General	12,732,230	Buddhist	242,057
Reading - Religious/Inspirational	2,467,110	Catholic	2,535,985
Reading - Science Fiction	695,915	Greek Orthodox	45,379
Reading - Top Sellers	2,275,408	Hindu	91,344
Religious/Inspirational Interest	3,670,790	Islamic	95,837
Space/Science Interest	1,293,652	Jewish	391,504
Smoking Tobacco	604,893	Sikh	9,128
Sweepstakes/Contests	4,053,706	Lutheran	8,587
Swimming Pool	1,832,040	Mormon	46,693
Wines	1,166,545	Eastern Orthodox	127,892
Woodworking	2,955,674	Protestant	9,616,927
		Shinto	
<b>Apparel</b>			
Apparel - Children	942,267	<b>Ethnicity</b>	
Apparel - General	10,097,560	African American	723362
Apparel - Infant/Toddler	496,416	American	5,768,220
Apparel - Junior	466,190	Arab	48,451
Apparel - Men	2,651,354	Asian	489,801
Apparel - Petite	419,156	Eastern European	567,403
Apparel - Plus Size	2,338,198	French	476,669
Apparel - Women	7,257,915	German	1,540,581
Apparel - Women's Footwear	1,849,132	Hispanic	723,362
		Italian	631,770
<b>Computers/Online/Electronics</b>		Jewish	319,096
Cell Phone	8,282,803	Mediterranean	1,559,951
DSL/Cable- High Speed Internet	3,137,343	Middle Eastern	62,060

DVD-VCR-Laser Disc Owner	842,254	Native American	30,764
PC Owner	11,320,957	Northern European	396,466
PC Software Buyer	5,773,490	Polynesian	40,071
PC Mac Owners	51,340	Scandinavian	317,370
Satellite Dish	750,729	Western European	10,069,160
Video Games	939,391		
Wireless Products	5,836,714		

**Health/Fitness**

Aerobic/Cardio	662,175
Dieting/Weight Loss	5,546,064
Exercise/Health General Interest	10,056,150
Natural Foods	4,258,278
Running/Jogging	1,438,045
Self-Improvement	3,118,273
Vegetarian	129,787
Walking	4,072,585

**ORDERING INSTRUCTIONS**

- To order this list, contact your List Broker and ask for NextMark List ID #79591 or [click here to place your request](#).
- 7,000 NAME MINIMUM ORDER \$0.00 MINIMUM PAYMENT
- 85% NET NAME AVAILABLE ON ORDERS OF 50,000 OR MORE (\$10.00/M RUN CHARGE)
- EXCHANGE IS NOT AVAILABLE
- REUSE IS AVAILABLE ON ORDERS OF 2,500

[Get Count](#)[Get Pricing](#)[Get More Information](#)



# **EXHIBIT C**

# Mailing List Finder

All Mailing Lists

- 1 Start 2 Results 3 Data Card 4 Request 5 Finished



**POSTAL, EMAIL AND TELEPHONE LISTS**

[Click Here](#)  
To Fill Out A Form And Receive A Free Quote

## TIME Magazine Enhanced Mailing List

TIME stays on top of all the important news and events happening around the world with interesting and thought provoking articles. From the latest breakthroughs in technology to the newest government policies affecting Americans, TIME gives insightful and in-depth reporting on many different topics to help readers make informed decisions concerning their family, their careers, their finances and even their personal time. TIME has been enhanced with InfoBase Data to identify hundreds of lifestyle and demographic segments.

[Get Count](#)

[Get Pricing](#)

[Get More Information](#)

SEGMENTS	COUNTS THROUGH 08/29/2013	
1,897,501 TOTAL UNIVERSE / BASE RATE		\$100.00/M
527,329 HOUSEHOLDS WITH CHILDREN		+ \$16.00/M
1,619,486 INCOME \$50K+		+ \$16.00/M
1,426,538 DONORS/CHARITABLE CAUSES		+ \$16.00/M
400,271 HAVE GRANDCHILDREN		+ \$16.00/M
1,429,344 HEALTH & FITNESS		+ \$16.00/M
1,340,438 INTEREST IN PERSONAL FINANCE		+ \$16.00/M
1,152,399 TRAVELERS		+ \$16.00/M
1,370,520 GARDENERS		+ \$16.00/M
1,163,973 FASHION/BEAUTY INTEREST		+ \$16.00/M
784,259 PET OWNERS		+ \$16.00/M
1,341,476 AGE 50+		+ \$16.00/M
FUNDRAISING/CATALOG RATE \$75/M		

### DESCRIPTION

TIME stays on top of all the important news and events happening around the world with interesting and thought provoking articles. From the latest breakthroughs in technology to the newest government policies affecting Americans, TIME gives insightful and in-depth reporting on many different topics to help readers make informed decisions concerning their family, their careers, their finances and even their personal time.



TIME has been enhanced with InfoBase Data to identify hundreds of lifestyle and demographic segments.

POPULARITY:	99
MARKET:	CONSUMER
CHANNELS:	<input type="checkbox"/>
SOURCE:	SEE DESCRIPTION
PRIVACY:	UNKNOWN
DMA?:	YES - MEMBER
STATUS:	STANDARD PROVIDER
GEO:	USA
GENDER:	47% FEMALE 53% MALE
SPENDING:	\$49.00 AVERAGE ORDER

### SELECTS

1 MONTH HOTLINE	\$16.00/M
3 MONTH HOTLINE	\$12.00/M
6 MONTH HOTLINE	\$8.00/M
AGE, INCOME	\$16.00/M
CANCELLATION FEE	\$100.00/F
COMPUTER	\$16.00/M
ETHNIC/ETHNICITY	\$16.00/M
GENDER/SEX	\$8.00/M
KEY CODE	\$2.00/M
LIFESTYLE	\$16.00/M
MINIMUM FULFILLMENT FEE	\$50.00/F
SOURCE	\$10.00/M
STATE, SCF, ZIP	\$8.00/M
ZIP PROCESSING FEE	\$50.00/F

### ADDRESSING

KEY CODING	\$2.00/M
FTP	\$50.00/F

### RELATED LISTS




- MONEY MAGAZINE ENHANCED
- FORTUNE ENHANCED
- TIME INC. MAGAZINES GROUP ENHANCED MASTERFILE
- SPORTS ILLUSTRATED ENHANCED
- AMERICAN EXPRESS PUBLISHING ENHANCED DATABASE
- FORTUNE
- CONDE NAST - ENHANCED DATABASE
- SMITHSONIAN MAGAZINE



**CONSUMERBASE MAKES IT EASY TO FIND YOUR TARGET AUDIENCE**

**FILTER YOUR LISTS WITH UNIQUE SELECTS AND FIND YOUR TARGET MARKET**

[GET A FREE QUOTE](#)

 ENHANCED DATABASE  
 GOLF MAGAZINE ENHANCED  
 ENTERTAINMENT WEEKLY ENHANCED

**Demographics/Profile:**

Women 47%  
 Men 53%  
 College Educated 72%  
 Median Age 46  
 Median Household Income \$ 73,842

**Source:**

Agents  
 Direct Mail  
 Insert Cards  
 Internet  
 Renewals  
 Television

**General Comments:**

For additional listing of lifestyles and demographic selects with counts, please refer to the list counts link.

**Pricing:**

Policy: Net Name 85%  
 Minimum: 50,000 Run Charge: \$10/M

**Terms:**

Cancelled orders before the mail date incurs: 100/L cancellation fee, output, applicable run charges and enhancement fees. Orders Cancelled after the mail date, full charges apply. All list rentals must be reciprocal to all Time Magazine offers.

**Additional Selects (Please inquire for specific counts)**

Demographics	Contributor/Donors
Age	Animal Welfare
Presence of Children 0-17	Arts/Cultural
Child Gender	Children
Number of Children in Household	Environmental/Wildlife
Household Income	Health
Networth	International Aid
Homeowners	Political
Home Value	Political - Conservative
Length of Residence	Political - Liberal
Married / Single	Religious
	Veterans

Veterans	General Donor
Voter - Democrat	Donates via Mail
Voter - Republican	<b>Travel</b>
Voter - Independent	Airline Travel
Voter Registered - No Party	Business Travel - Domestic
<b>Hobbies/Interests</b>	Cruise
American History Interest	Family Vacation
Arts	Frequent Flyer
Auto Work/Mechanics	International Travel
Avid Music Listener	Leisure Travel
Beauty/Fashion	RV
Birdwatching	Time Share
Book Enthusiast	Travel in US
Casino Gambling	Travel Purchase
Children/Family Interest	<b>Personal Finance</b>
Collectibles	Money Seekers
Collectibles - Antiques	Personal Finance - Active Investors
Collectibles - Arts	Personal Finance - Foreign
Collectibles - Coins	Investments
Collectibles - Stamps	Personal Finance - Real Estate
Cooking	Personal Investments
Cooking- Gourmet	Real Estate Investments
Cooking- Low Fat	Stocks/Bonds
Crafts	<b>Sports/Outdoors</b>
Crafts - Knit/Crochet	ATV Interest
Crafts - Needlepoint	Auto Racing Interest
Crafts - Painting	Baseball Interest

Crafts - Quilting	Basketball Interest
Crafts - Scrapbooking	Boat Owner
Crafts - Sewing	Boating/Sailing Interest
Crafts - Woodworking	Camping/Hiking Interest
Current Affairs	Equestrian Interest
Gardening	Fishing Interest
Gift Givers	Football Interest
Grandchildren	Golf Interest
History/Military Interest	Hockey Interest
Home Furnishing	Hunting/Shooting Interest
Home Improvement Interest	Motorcycles
Mail Order Buyer	Mountain Biking Interest
Pet Owner	NASCAR Interest
Pets - Cat Owner	Power Boating Interest
Pets - Dog Owner	Scuba Diving
Photography Enthusiast	Skateboarding
Photography Interest	Skiing
Reading - General	Skiing Products Purchase
Reading - Religious/Inspirational	Snowboarding
Reading - Science Fiction	Soccer
Reading - Top Sellers	Tennis
Religious/Inspirational Interest	Water Sports
Space/Science Interest	<b>Religion</b>
Smoking Tobacco	Buddhist
Sweepstakes/Contests	Catholic
Swimming Pool	Greek Orthodox
Wines	Hindu

	Islamic
Woodworking	
	Jewish
<b>Apparel</b>	
	Sikh
Apparel - Children	
	Lutheran
Apparel - General	
	Mormon
Apparel - Infant/Toddler	
	Eastern Orthodox
Apparel - Junior	
	Protestant
Apparel - Men	
	Shinto
Apparel - Petite	
	<b>Ethnicity</b>
Apparel - Plus Size	
	African American
Apparel - Women	
	American
Apparel - Women's Footwear	
	Arab
<b>Computers/Online/Electronics</b>	
	Asian
Cell Phone	
	Eastern European
DSL/Cable - High Speed	
Internet	
	French
DVD/VCR/Laser Disc Owner	
	German
PC Owner	
	Hispanic
PC Software Buyer	
	Italian
PC Mac Owners	
	Jewish
Satellite Dish	
	Mediterranean
Video Games	
	Middle Eastern
Wireless Products	
	Native American
<b>Health/Fitness</b>	
	Northern European
Aerobic/Cardio	
	Polynesian
Dieting/Weight Loss	
	Scandinavian
Exercise/Health General	
Interest	
	Western European
Natural Foods	

Running/Jogging

Self-Improvement

Vegetarian

Walking

#### ORDERING INSTRUCTIONS

- To order this list, contact your List Broker and ask for NextMark List ID #79587 or [click here to place your request](#).
- 7,000 NAME MINIMUM ORDER \$0.00 MINIMUM PAYMENT
- 85% NET NAME AVAILABLE ON ORDERS OF 50,000 OR MORE (\$10.00/M RUN CHARGE)
- PLEASE INQUIRE ABOUT EXCHANGE
- REUSE IS AVAILABLE ON ORDERS OF 2,500

[Get Count](#)

[Get Pricing](#)

[Get More Information](#)

© 2013 NextMark, Inc. | [Terms and conditions of Use](#)